Terminal Evaluation for the Programme

Strengthening Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration in HIV prevention and control in Vietnam

UNDP Vietnam

Prepared by

TNS Vietnam
Public & Social
Jean-Pierre Depasse
Dam Thu Hang

Hanoi, May 2009
Contents

Abbreviations 1

Executive summary 2

1 Background and Objectives 4
  1.1 Background of the assignment 4
  1.2 Evaluation Objectives 5

2 Evaluation Criteria and Methodology 6
  2.1 Evaluation criteria 6
  2.2 Methodology 6
    2.2.1 In-depth desk research 7
    2.2.2 In-depth field research 7
    2.2.3 Assessment and Reporting 10

3 Outputs 12
  3.1 Relevance 12
    3.1.1 Relevance to the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS 12
    3.1.2 Relevance to the One Plan 2 13
  3.2 Effectiveness 15
  3.3 Sustainability of project outputs 17
    3.3.1 Sustainable 17
    3.3.2 Unsustainable 18

4 Contributions to the Outcome 20
  4.1 Enhancing legal and policy framework 20
  4.2 Collaboration Party & National Assembly 25
  4.3 IEC activities 25
  4.4 Multi-sectoral collaboration 28
  4.5 Leadership and knowledge in HIV/AIDS prevention and control area 30
    4.5.1 Knowledge of HIV/AIDS 30
    4.5.2 Agreement on Harm reduction interventions 30
  4.6 Overall evaluation 31

5 Conclusions and Recommendations 32
Abbreviations

AIDS Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
CCPE Central Party Commission for Popularization and Education
HCM NPA Ho Chi Minh National Political Administrative Academy
HIV Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IEC Information, Education and Communication
MIS Monitoring Information System
MoH Ministry of Health
PCSA Parliamentary Committee for Social Affairs of the National Assembly
PLHIV People Living With HIV
PPC Provincial People’s Committee
Project 00040232 Strengthening the Party’s Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration for the Successful Implementation of the National Strategy for HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control to 2010
Project 00042513 Strengthening the Leadership Role and Multi-sectoral Cooperation of People-elected Bodies and Government Agencies at Different Levels for the Successful Implementation of the National HIV/AIDS Strategy until 2010
SIDA Swedish International Development Agency
TNS Vietnam Taylor Nelson Sofres Vietnam Pte Ltd
USAIDUNAIDS the Joint United Nation Programme on HIV/AIDS
UNDP United Nations Development Programme
VAAC Vietnam Administration of HIV/AIDS Control
Executive summary

This report was prepared for United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA) by Taylor Nelson Sofres Vietnam Pte Ltd (TNS Vietnam).

The terminal evaluation assignment was conducted in January-May 2009. Based on the methodology approved by the client, the consultant team carried out an in-depth desk research, 17 in-depth interviews with the projects initiators and implementers and 120 face to face interviews with projects participants in Lang Son, Khanh Hoa and An Giang, before starting the overall analytical exercise.

The consultant team focused on the evaluation of the Project’s Outputs (in terms of Relevance, Effectiveness and Sustainability) to assess, review and analyze their contributions to the Outcome.

The independent evaluators assessed that in general, both projects have been successfully implemented and meet most of objectives mentioned in projects documents.

The objectives of the 2 projects were highly relevant with the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Vietnam till 2010 and a vision to 2020 which includes behaviour change in Information, Education and Communication (IEC); creation of a legal framework that conforms with the international laws; decentralization of management in HIV/AIDS prevention and control, the program management, monitoring, supervision and evaluation capabilities.

In line with One Plan 2, those projects aimed at contributing directly to the achievement of the UN country programme outputs on stigma and discrimination against PLHIV and people affected by HIV, improved HIV coordination and planning, etc.

Through the IEC activities, the stigma and discrimination was significantly decreased at all levels. But in provincial level, the projects officers meet difficulties while conducting the IEC activities at their locality, including lack of staff, lack of specialists and lack of community interest. It is recommended that those barriers should be minimized by providing more training courses, technical assistance to the local stakeholders and more awareness raising campaigns and events oriented to the community.

The framework for project implementation supported by UNDP is very structured and clear but it might be more effective if UNDP spent more resource for the implementing partner to be more familiar with this framework.

It is recommended that the UNDP or donor should work more closely with the stakeholder to build the technical assistance framework before deliver to the project areas to ensure the relevance, so that there would be consistent understanding across Project teams for more efficient implementation.

The projects activities were relevant and effective but sometimes their timely implementation was delayed due to lack of human resources at provincial level. Therefore the projects should recruit high qualified staff, especially in technical support and M&E activities.
The Resolutions on HIV/AIDS prevention and control were promulgated by provincial and district people’s Committees, Councils at the 3 project provinces. Those resolutions stipulate the targets and solutions for the implementation of HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities in accordance with the socio-economic conditions and localities. Besides, the project contributed directly to the “mainstreaming the HIV/AIDS indicators in the socio-economic development plan.

The legal documents were established but the supervision parts are not strong enough to make sure that the laws are really effective. The evaluators recommend for future projects, Ministry of Justice to be involved in the project activities.

Some project’s achievements may not be able to sustain without financial support after the projects closing. In addition, there has yet to be a mechanism to encourage financial support from internal sources rather than foreign aid. It is suggested that a fund raising mechanism should be developed with the participation of all sides and to create a stable fund to maintain the effective activities in the future.

One of the most significant results of the projects was to build capacity to people elected bodies and party organisations at all level in the legal and policy framework: implementation and supervision of two important documents which meet the international standards - Directive 54 and Law on HIV/AIDS prevention and control. It contributes to create a transparent legal and policy framework to carry out the HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities such harm reduction interventions.

The multi-sectoral collaboration mechanism was institutionalized to the local level. In 3 projects provinces, the mainstream of the HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities to the local socio-economic development plan was just implemented in two last project years. It is recommended that the HIV/AIDS prevention and control should be mainstreamed into the local socio-economic development plan and implement accordingly since beginning of the implementation of project’s activities.

The duties and responsibilities of ministries, branches and agencies in HIV/AIDS prevention and control are now regulated in the new HIV Law; however, the implementation of the cooperation amongst those bodies is ineffective.

An experience exchange meeting should be organized with the participation of the central project management board, the donor, 3 provincial project management board and 5 new projects provinces before implementing the projects activities in those provinces. The central project management board should set up an information sharing mechanism to the project provinces to ensure the project activities’ compliance.

The knowledge of the participants in 3 provinces is significantly improved through the projects activities, most of them does not consider HIV as a social evil or threat to the public health, moreover they express the responsibility to the community when they share that HIV prevention and control is not only the responsibility of MoH but also of society.

The interventions applied to reduce the HIV harms are highly agreed by the local participants.
1 Background and Objectives

1.1 Background of the assignment

Based on the lessons learned from the previous projects and fitting in the new legal framework for HIV/AIDS prevention and control, a UNDP/SIDA funded programme entitled “Strengthening Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration in HIV Prevention and Control” (Leadership Programme) has been developed in 2004, launched in 2005 and had completed in March 2009.

The aim of the programme was to strengthen the leadership role and multi-sectoral collaboration for the successful implementation of the National Strategy for HIV prevention and control, and contribute to the achievement of UN One Plan 2 Outcome 1 named “Social and economic development policies, plans and laws support equitable and inclusive growth and conform to the values and goals of the Millennium Declaration and other relevant international agreements and conventions”.

The Programme had two components/projects namely:

- **At Party’s level - Project 40232**

  “Strengthening the Party’s Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration for the Successful Implementation of the National Strategy for HIV Prevention and Control to 2010”

  This project is implemented by the Central Party Commission for Popularization and Education (CCPE)

- **At People-elected Bodies and Government Agencies levels - Project 42513**

  “Strengthening the Leadership Role and Multi-sectoral Cooperation of People-elected Bodies and Government Agencies at Different Levels for the Successful Implementation of the National HIV and AIDS Strategy until 2010 with a vision to 2020”.

  This project was implemented by the Parliamentary Committee for Social Affairs of the National Assembly (PCSA)

The expected outputs of the two projects mainly focused on: i) the development of legal framework for HIV/AIDS response and control, including monitoring mechanisms and

---

1 Projects expected outputs to be evaluated as formulated in project documents were:

For CCPE Project 40232: a) Development and issuance of a new Party Directive to strengthen the area of HIV prevention and control, a renovation of the Party’s approach to behaviour change communication as well as information, education and communication messages; b) Strengthening of multi-sectoral collaboration and effective integration of HIV and AIDS indicators/activities into local socio-economic development plans and programmes, primarily in the project provinces; c) Regular and close supervision of the implementation of Party resolutions and directives, law making projects, socio-economic development plans with HIV prevention and control in order to ensure a successful implementation of the National HIV and AIDS Strategy.

For PCSA Project 42513: (a) Development and issuance of HIV Law and its guiding document for implementation (b) Amendment/Review of all legal documents in line with the new law on HIV (c) Strengthening of multi-sectoral
Strengthening Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration in HIV Prevention and Control in Vietnam

implementation guidelines/documents; ii) strengthening of leadership knowledge in HIV/AIDS response and control; iii) Support to multi-sectoral mechanism and HIV mainstreaming into local SEDPs; and iv) revision/amendment of legal documents in line with the new HIV law.

The aim of this terminal evaluation was to assess how and to which extent the activities implemented and outputs achieved of the two projects have contributed to the programme outcome.

1.2 Evaluation Objectives

More precisely, the objective of this evaluation is to focus on project outputs and outcome levels:

- **Relevance**: relevance of the programme outputs and contribution to HIV/AIDS national strategies and priorities in Vietnam – role of UNDP – contribution to the One UN objectives – relevance of key strategic partners

- **Progress in achieving the intended outputs and the contributions to the outcome**

- **Effectiveness**: effectiveness in selecting key activities, mobilisation of inputs, programme implementation, management structure, choice of implementing partners, coordination, cooperation among stakeholders, technical assistance and support

- **Sustainability**: sustainability issues of the achieved outputs

- **Key lessons**: for replication/expansion of best practices and recommendations for the future
2 Evaluation Criteria and Methodology

2.1 Evaluation criteria

The two projects 42513/40232 being interlinked, the analysis is conducted across both projects at the same time and the conclusions drawn at total programme level.

For the point of view of the evaluator, we often want to determine the extent to which the program was contributed a needed change. Besides, according to the main objective of the evaluation assignment which is to systematically and coherently assess, review and analyze the achievements (negative and positive, intended and unintended) of the expected outputs of the two projects and their contributions, the following issues and criteria were thoroughly evaluated:

- **Outputs**

  *Tangible activities of the programme set up to achieve the objectives or as defined in UNDP Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluating for Results “outputs, are the specific products and services that emerge from processing inputs through programme, project and other activities (such as through ad hoc soft assistance delivered outside of projects and programmes).*

  The outputs have been analyzed in terms of **Relevance, Effectiveness and Sustainability** of the project activities:

  - **Relevance**: the degree to which the objectives of the programme remain valid and pertinent as originally planned or as subsequently modified owing to changing circumstances within the immediate context and external environment of that programme.

  - **Effectiveness**: evaluation of effectiveness provides answer to an overall question of “have the project outputs and their contributions to the outcome been effectively produced?”

  - **Sustainability**: The evaluators paid particular attention to sustainability issues of the achieved outputs and their contributions to the outcome. The evaluators provided relevant, realistic and evidenced based recommendations and tentative priorities for action to implementing partners, government and donor agencies and UN/DP to ensure long term sustainability of the project results.

- **Outcomes**

  *Outcomes of UNDP development efforts which are the changes in development conditions that UNDP aims to achieve through its projects and programmes. Outcomes incorporate the production of outputs and the contributions of partners.*

2.2 Methodology

It would be strongly recommended that the evaluation methodology to be based on maximal utilization of the existing information (projects progress reports, minutes of review meetings,
reports of study tours, evaluation report of Directive 54, etc) and to be participatory and inclusive. Furthermore, in line with the above mentioned objectives, criteria, and the following methodology has been conducted:

2.2.1 **In – depth desk research**

To maximize the use of the available documents provided by UNDP, internet and other sources, the in – depth desk was conducted, including but not limited to the following activities:

- Analysis of progress reports, minutes of review meetings, evaluation of training workshops, reports of study tours...

- Analysis of baseline surveys/data, assessments/reviews and evaluations (Directives 52 and 54)

- Review of several evaluation report such as (i) Report evaluating results of activities implemented by HCM NPA within the project “Strengthening the Party’s leadership and multi-sectoral collaboration for the successful implementation of the national strategy for HIV/AIDS prevention and control to 2010” (ii) Outcome Evaluation on L4R Programme in HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Hanoi and in localities where Breakthrough Initiatives (BI) were implemented under leadership for results (L4R) programme (iii) Report research findings: Awareness, attitude and training needs of officials from party organs, authorities in implementing the Information-Education-Communication (IEC) activities to change the behaviour for HIV/AIDS prevention and combat (3/2006)

- Analysis of key documents covering these subjects which have been provided by UNDP and Partners.

2.2.2 **In – depth field research**

According to the evaluation objectives, the in – depth field research model below was developed in close collaboration with UNDP and Partners:
2.2.2.1 In – depth interviews – Initiators and Implementers

A sample of 17 respondents has been built up in collaboration with UNDP and Partners. The evaluation team made efforts to ensure that the qualitative interviews incorporated members of the Steering Committees, National Assembly, Party Commissions and donors. The breakdown of informants that the consultant has worked with is as below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Initiators</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Implementers</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Initiators and Implementers</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An interview guide for 60 minutes in – depth interview has been developed for Initiators and Implementers. The structure of the discussion guide is given here under.

- Structure of the Discussion guide for Initiators (open-questions only)
  - **Warming-up**: what were the overall objectives of the program in general and in terms of activities, etc
  - **Evaluation of the outcome**: what are the concrete results of the program in terms of activities - trainings/workshops, MIS, booklets, study tours...
Strengthening Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration in HIV Prevention and Control in Vietnam

- Implementation of the two projects: in general and by activity, in terms competence of the implementers, material used, budget available...

- Coordination of the program: strengths & weaknesses, obstacles/barriers, impact on effectiveness, improvement areas – multi-sectoral collaboration

- Impact of the program: on the different categories of actors, mainly on participants but also on implementers and initiators, in terms of HIV leadership capabilities

- Sustainability of the program: long term approach, improvement needed in terms of contents, implementation, coordination

- Expectations and priorities for the future

Structure of the Discussion guide for Implementers (open-questions only)

- Warming-up: what were the overall objectives of the program in general and in terms of activities, etc

- Evaluation of the outcome: what are the concrete results of the program in terms of activities - trainings/workshops, MIS, booklets, study tours...

- Implementation of the two projects: in general and by activity, in terms competence of the implementers, material used, budget available...

- Coordination of the program: strengths & weaknesses, obstacles/barriers, impact on effectiveness, improvement areas – multi-sectoral collaboration

- Impact of the program: on the different categories of actors, mainly on participants but also on implementers and initiators, in terms of HIV leadership capabilities

- Sustainability of the program: long term approach, improvement needed in terms of contents, implementation, coordination

- Expectations and priorities for the future

2.2.2.2 Face to face interview - Participants

A quantitative research was conducted in across the 3 project provinces for all three levels: province, district and commune with sample size of 120 selected from the list of participants provided by the UNDP and Partners. A questionnaire for 40 minutes of face to face interview has been developed – the structure is given hereunder. The breakdown of survey sample size is showed in the table below:
Strengthening Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration in HIV Prevention and Control in Vietnam

Table 2: Sample for face to face interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Provincial level</th>
<th>District level</th>
<th>Commune level</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>An Giang</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Khanh Hoa</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Lang Son</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>73</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Structure of the Questionnaire:**
  - *HIV Documents Awareness:* Awareness of Program and main objectives; Awareness and Familiarity of Documents and Laws;
  - *Training Evaluation:* Subjects covered, rating by subject; How useful, how applicable; Application of the courses;
  - *IEC:* IEC activities; Frequency; Issues and problems;
  - *Technical Support:* Material provided: official documents, booklets…; Specific questions on MIS: aim, implementation; Project coordination – evaluation;
  - *HIV Prevention knowledge:* Familiarity with HIV and HIV prevention (list of statements); HIV prevention interventions (condoms, safe injection…); Barriers for better prevention (importance)
  - *Overall Assessment:* Overall perception of program; Program evaluation on a list of 15 attributes (score 1 to 10): Useful, applicable, Efficient mobilization of inputs, Easy implementation, Good coordination, Technical support, Sustainable, Highly effective program …Major improvements needed for the future (list + open-end)
  - *Demographics:* Respondent’s Profile

2.2.3 Assessment and Reporting

- **Assessment:** In this step, the result from the in – depth desk research was mainstreamed into the data collected from the in – depth field research for final assessment with the mentioned above criteria. In addition, the evaluator has used both qualitative and quantitative analysis in this assignment.
  - *Qualitative data analysis was used for data collected during the face to face and in – depth interviews and from the in – depth desk research. Analysing qualitative data can reveal some of most valuable information.*
- **Quantitative data analysis**: we will use statistical tools for analysing statistical data obtained for indicators.

Upon the completion of 120 face to face interviews, the evaluator had conducted both qualitative and quantitative analysis of the available data. The data collected, once imported into the database, will be cross checked to ensure the accuracy and consistency. After that, the following works were performed:

- *an analysis of our findings;*

- *a formulation of conclusions; and*

- *preparation of supporting documentation for the report.*

**Presentation**: A presentation workshop was organized in 25th March, 2009 to present the evaluation results to the donors and stakeholders.

**Finalise report**: Once the comments of donors and stakeholders are delivered, the report would be integrated to finalise. This step will be done in close consultation with the client.
3 Outputs

3.1 Relevance

3.1.1 Relevance to the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS

All of 17 respondents from both projects had commented that the objectives of the 2 projects were highly relevant with the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Vietnam till 2010 and a vision to 2020 which has been approved by Prime Minister in 17th March, 2004.

The overall objective of the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Vietnam till 2010 with a vision to 2020 is to control the HIV/AIDS prevalence rate among the general population to below 0.3% by 2010 and with no further increase after 2010; and to reduce the adverse impacts of HIV/AIDS on social-economic development.

National Strategy on HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control of Vietnam

The National Strategy is prioritized on behavioural change in Information, Education and Communication (IEC) implementations.

The project 40232’s output no.2 is in line with this activity by targeting to redesign Party guidelines and plans on IEC activities for behaviour change on HIV/AIDS prevention and control in the spirit of related Directive and Resolution and to implement in this renovated sense through the mass media and in direct communication interventions at different levels. Some of the key results are:

- The CCPE and 3 project provinces have developed and implemented the Plan for behaviour change communication (BCC) in HIV/AIDS prevention and control via mass media;

- The CCPE compiled the teaching tools kit/materials on renovation of IEC activities for behaviour change in HIV/AIDS prevention and control and conducted capacity building trainings for key officers from mass media agencies at Central level and 3 project provinces;

- Teaching staff and officers working in the system of Ho Chi Minh National Political Administrative Academy (HCM NPA) were updated and supplemented with knowledge of contents related to IEC activities for behaviour change in the spirit of Directive 54; and

- Circle of artists and writers, the mass media people as well as other social strata in the whole country were mobilized to be involved in initiating IEC products for behaviour change in HIV prevention and control.

The National Strategy was to create a legal framework that conforms the international laws. The project 40232’s output no.1 reached to empower the Party commissions at all levels in
building a favourable environment for the effective implementation of the National Strategy’s solutions. UNDP as a donor has provided technical support to Central Party Commission for Science and Education and Commission for Ideology and Culture to develop the Directive 54, including input on issue such as harm reduction, stigma and discrimination, gender and community involvement. The support ranged from the setting up a Management Information System (MIS) to sending cadres on study tours inside Vietnam and overseas. In other hand, the project 42513 focused more on the People elected bodies and Government agencies at all level. Thus, this project followed same direction and solved the same issues addressed by project 40232 but adapted to different segment. The project contributed directly to the development and promulgation of number of strategic legal documents and policies such as:

- Law on HIV/AIDS prevention and control (June 29th, 2006) and its implementation and guidelines legal documents developed and implemented in open consultation with a wide range of stakeholders;

- Law amending and supplementing law on drug prevention and control approved by the NA in June 2008 and took into effective as from January 1st, 2009. With the technical assistance from the Project, certain provisions and amendments related to Drug law, especially harm reduction interventions were added in line with the HIV law; and

- Resolution on HIV/AIDS prevention and control were promulgated by provincial and district People’s Councils at 3 project provinces. The resolutions had stipulated targets and solutions for the implementation of HIV/AIDS prevention and control according to the socio-economic conditions of localities.

In addition, the project 42513 also sought to provide capacity building on laws and executive aptitudes for People councils and People elected bodies.

Another viewpoint of National Strategy is to develop the decentralization of management in HIV/AIDS prevention and control, the program management, monitoring, supervision and evaluation capabilities. Project 40232 aims to enhance the Party leaders’ ability to coordinate across sectors and integrate their agenda into the socio development plans and programmes with many activities focused on raising awareness, knowledge and understanding; and providing technical support to build a structure that allows more smooth integration of all sectors into the subject.

“The main objective of the project is to build capacity for leaders in the fight against HIV/AIDS. This leaves a structure for the future, which fits well with the objectives of the national framework”.

“The fact that the Programme involves both the Party, People elected bodies and the Government is a relevant context for consistency in policies and execution”.

### 3.1.2 Relevance to the One Plan 2

The projects 40232 and 42513 were conducted within the context of One Plan 2 that builds on the key components of the UN Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2006-2010; on Country Programme documents (CPDs) and Country Programme Action Plans (CPAPs)
Strengthening Leadership and Multi-sectoral Collaboration in HIV Prevention and Control in Vietnam

(2006-2010) previously developed by 14 UN agencies. In particular, relevance of the projects was assessed against One Plan 2 Outcome 1, named: “Social and economic development policies, plans and laws support equitable and inclusive growth and conform to the values and goals of the Millennium Declaration and other relevant international agreements and conventions.”

In line with One Plan 2, those projects aimed at contributing directly to the achievement of the following UN country programme outputs:

- **Stigma and discrimination against PLHIV and people affected by HIV reduced through improved communication work on HIV.**
- **Improved HIV Coordination and Planning**
- **Strengthened capacities of national and provincial people’s representatives and leaders to ensure that HIV concerns are mainstreamed in policies, legal documents and plans and their implementation is monitored, in order to ensure stigma and discrimination-free, multi-sectoral and gender sensitive approaches to HIV and protection of rights of PLHIV.**

The section 4 will present in more details on the IEC activities, multi-sectoral collaboration, knowledge and leadership, etc to prove their relevance to the One Plan 2.

Moreover, the project 40232 has followed strictly the pre-determined targets. Besides, in project 42513, the target groups were not only the people in the 3 planned areas but also extended to the other provinces.

> “I think people in other high risk provinces should also be given the access to those means, which was why we included them in the training.”

Implementer of project 42513

All of targeted groups are appeared in the table below

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Project 40232</th>
<th>Project 42513</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Party leader at central level</td>
<td>People elected bodies leaders at central level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Party leader at local level in 3 project provinces</td>
<td>People elected bodies leaders at local level in 3 project provinces</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 UNDAF 2006 – 2010 Outcomes 1 and 3 namely: “Government Economic policies support growth that is more equitable, inclusive sustainable” and “Policies, law and governance structures conform to the values and goals of the Millennium Declaration”
3.2 Effectiveness

For project 40232, by the end of June 2007, 90 training courses on Directive 54 and its guidelines as well as the action plan of each province and the HIV prevention and control law had been delivered to 10,250 key staffs in 3 provinces from provincial level to commune level.

The technical support including recruitment of technical expert, training, workshops…was delivered to 91 pilot communes in 3 project provinces. It resulted that the resolution on HIV/AIDS prevention and control had been built and grasped thoroughly in 61 communes in Lang Son and An Giang; and 30 communes in Khanh Hoa had promulgated and grasped thoroughly the action plan on implementation of Directive 54 and provincial decision.

The project management board in Lang Son had provided advice to the Provincial Party Committee and 11/11 Party committees at district level to develop and to promulgate the guidelines the implementation of the Directive 54, e.g. the Provincial Standing Party Committee issued Directive 16 CT/TU dated March 10th, 2007, the district and town party committees issued directives, district people committee had Action plan, etc.

An Giang also disseminated instructional documents to Secretaries of party cells of hamlets, villages as well as religious dignitaries; supported An Giang newspaper and provincial radio television station to widely communicate among people on the contents of these documents.


For project 42513, the people elected bodies at different levels have enhanced knowledge and fully updated information about HIV/AIDS in Vietnam, in their communities and in other countries and about policies and legislation on HIV/AIDS. A workshop with the participation of the experts was organised to discuss, to amend the HIV/AIDS prevention and control handbook and it resulted 500 handbooks to deliver to the elected bodies. A workshop to update the Law of HIV/AIDS and to exchange the relevant experience amongst the elected bodies and other countries was also organised. Moreover, the study tour was provided to the elected bodies by sending 12 elected delegates to Mexico for an international workshop and so on.

The establishment of MIS 54 is assessed to be highly effective, in line with the expected Output 1. The fact that UNDP consultants helped to build and pilot the MIS-54 system as well as to issue instruction at local levels greatly contributed to enhancing Party cadre’s monitoring capacity. However, according to the donor, UNDP has been requested to fully support the pilot of the system, including running costs. This may cause important sustainability issues after the project closing up. It was said by quite a few implementers that the MIS-54 could not work after the project since the local Party did not receive financial aid from the project.
However, the expectation is quite out of the scope of the project. As such, the sustainability aspect has not been ensured in the implementation process of the project.

“Some activities such as the MIS-54, we think could have been more relevant if we offer technical support rather than funding the activities. You know, the role of UNDP is to build capacity more than funding activities.”

Donor

Effectiveness in the provision of Technical support

Technical support plays a crucial role in both 02 projects, it contributed to improve the capacity to the projects’ beneficiaries. The technical support was delivered to the projects' stakeholder by providing not only the Senior Technical Advisor of the programme as well as UNDP and the Joint team on HIV/AIDS, (UNAIDS in particular) but also a large number of national expertise/consultant.

At central level, the project 42513 had provided the consultant to review, analyse the law on HIV/AIDS control and prevention and 12 related legal documents. The project had organised also the consultative workshops for people elected bodies officials at different levels to get comments and review on the report before submitted to the NA for consideration and approval. Those activities were highly appreciated in terms of effectiveness and the more deeply analysis will be appeared in section 4.1.

With project 40232’s technical support, the CCPE and the MoH has improved their capacity in development of a Directive and submitted to the Central Party Secretariat for the promulgation of the Directive 54 with good quality in a methodical and scientific way and to develop the Guideline for the implementation of this Directive (No.15-HD/BKGTW-BCSD dated February 14th, 2006 of CCPE and MoH).

At provincial level, MoH (27%) and Committee for ideological education (26%) had played the important roles to deliver the technical support to the projects staffs at all levels. However, the technical support from the centers for prevention was limited with 12%. It is recommended to enhance the role of those centers in further interventions.
The technical support was highly appreciated by the stakeholders at provincial, district and commune levels. 88% of respondent assess the quality of technical support as good (45%) and very good (43%) while no one gives negative comment. Besides, 61% of respondent, a high percentage, shares that the technical support was frequently provided.

### Fig. 2: Assessment on technical support’s quality (n = 120)

#### 3.3 Sustainability of project outputs

#### 3.3.1 Sustainable

For project 40232, most respondents believe that the parts of the project that will remain sustainable after the project end include an improved awareness among target respondents of Directive 54 and established materials for IEC activities.
For project 42513, most respondents believe that the parts of the project that will remain sustainable after the project end include a better knowledge of the HIV/AIDS Law and Decree 108 because the revised legal documents is consistent with the Law of HIV/AIDS.

The Resolutions on HIV/AIDS prevention and control were promulgated by provincial and district people’s Committees at the 3 project provinces. Those resolutions stipulate the targets and solutions for the implementation of HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities in accordance with the socio-economic conditions and localities. E.g. Lang Son PPC issued the Resolution No.110/2007/NG-HDND on the programme of HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Lang Son until 2010 with a vision to 2020. Resolutions set the target that HIV prevalence rate in the locality will be limited by 0.3% in 2010 and will not be increased after 2020.

Besides, the project contributed directly to the “mainstreaming the HIV/AIDS indicators in the socio-economic development plan”, E.g. the Khanh Hoa PPC issued Decision No.783/QD-UBND promulgating list of indicators to evaluate the AIDS control programme. Khanh Hoa PPC also approved the annual target of HIV/AIDS prevention and control would be one of annual provincial economic development targets.

An assessment on sustainability is also presented in the section 4.6.

### 3.3.2 Unsustainable

Most respondents express worries about the mobility of cadres. There are concerns that, because of the limited tenure, especially among National Assembly Representatives, those we were trained through the project may not be able to exercise their knowledge for a long time as they retire or change positions.

However, Project 42513 also showed that while top leaders may be mobile, a certain group of cadres under them, who also went through training, are less susceptible to tenure changes. These people can be the seed of sustainability.

In terms of finance, it is appeared that the project managers at central level had used the project money to pay for their trip to the project provinces for monitoring activities or to hire the consultant to prepare the project progress reports. Once the project finished, no more fund would be used for those activities and it led a un-sustainability.

There are also concerns that, even though legal documents were established, the supervision parts are not strong enough to make sure that the laws are really effective. There are also suggestions that the Ministry of Justices should have been involved in the project for further supervision.

The MIS 54 to monitor and to evaluate the framework for Directive 54 implementation was developed and has been piloted since June 2008; however this activity was implemented in 181 communes and 18 districts of 3 projects provinces. Due to its low coverage and short time usage, MIS 54 has not been able to replace the conventional method that combines the report activity and supervision activity of Party at all levels.
Like all projects with foreign aid, sustainability is still open to question. Mobilizing resources internally is a tough thing because we have so many other issues to take care of, not just HIV/AIDS.

Implementer – Project 40232

Respondents from both projects express worries that the following achievements may not be able to sustain without financial support after the projects close: Breakthrough Initiative Program, MIS-54, Winning works of the Contest for innovative ideas in IEC (without financial support, it would be hard for them to spread the products to the public and reach the target respondents).
4 Contributions to the Outcome

The projects have produced 5 major results as contribution to the project outcome / One Plan 2 outcome 1 “Social and economic development policies, plans and laws support equitable and inclusive growth and conform to the values and goals of the Millennium Declaration and other relevant international agreements and conventions”:

The projects have produced 5 major contributions:

1. **LEGAL & POLICY**
   - Enhancing legal and policy framework
   - Especially in implementation
   - Favorable environment for HIV prevention

2. **COLLABORATION PARTY NATIONAL ASS.**
   - Strengthening Leadership
   - In guiding local work on HIV

3. **IEC**
   - Party’s guidelines on IEC
   - Directions for behavior change and anti-discrimination

4. **MULTISECTORAL COLLABORATION**
   - Testing and improving the mechanism
   - Especially in AN GIANG

5. **LEADERSHIP & KNOWLEDGE**
   - Key challenges
   - Further commitment
   - Allocation of human resources

Each of these contributions is analyzed and illustrated here under.

4.1 Enhancing legal and policy framework

At central level, the HIV law was approved by NA and took into effective since January 1st, 2007. There are many new and emerging issues from the current and old laws and legal documents that have some inconsistencies and discrepancies with the new law on HIV need to be amended. The project 42513 had provided the consultant to support this activity. The consultant team had reviewed, analysed HVI/AIDS related regulations in 12 legal documents including: Law on HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control, the Ordinance of Prostitution Prevention and Control, Law on PIT, Law on Communicable Disease Prevention and Control, the Criminal Code, Law on Health Insurance, Law on Red Cross, Law on Amnesty and draft Law on Elderly.

In addition, some other legal documents were issued through the technical assistance of the projects are: Decree No.108/2007/ND-CP dated June 26th, 2007 of the Government details and
provides guidelines on the Law of HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control; Decision No.120/2008/QD-TTg of Prime Minister dated August 29th, 2008 of MoH on the conditions for identifying person who exposed to or infected with HIV/AIDS due to occupational accidents; Law No.23/2008/QH10 dated June 3rd, 2008 of NA on Amending, supplementing several provisions in the Law on Drug Prevention and Control.

At provincial level, many resolutions were issued during the implementation of projects activities.


Similar to Khanh Hoa, the resolutions on the programme of HIV/AIDS prevention and control for period 2007 – 2010 and vision to 2020 were also issued in Lang Son, An Giang and its districts.

For project 42513, the overseas study tours and the participation in international conferences were delivered to the Member of Parliaments and provincial elected bodies officials to learn international experiences in the development and implementation of strategies and policies on HIV/AIDS, drugs prevention and control such as harm reduction methods, using ARVs, anti-stigma and discrimination toward PLHIVs and the multi-sectoral collaboration in HIV/AIDS prevention and control.

The study tours gave us lots of useful knowledge and experience, e.g. we could build up the 3 Selves after the study tour to India, the multi-sectoral collaboration (between Public Security and Health Sectors) mechanism after the study tour to Australia.

Implementer of project 42513

One of the most important objectives of the project is to raise awareness to the government officials in project areas by deliver to them the documents as can be seen in the chart below. 81% of respondent share that they completely understand the Directive 54 issued by Central Party (please see the analysis in next part for more details). Besides, the percentage of the project staffs at provincial, district and commune level understanding deeply the other documents such HIV/AIDS law, National strategy on HIV/AIDS prevention and control is high with 79% and 61% respectively. Those high percentages indicate that the projects were successful in transferring knowledge to the beneficiaries in projects areas. Besides, only 28% of respondent comment that they understand well the Three Selves. All of documents related to HIV/AIDS are important and this low percentage is considered as a failure of the projects’ activities.
Fig. 3: Assessment of knowledge of Documents (n = 120)

- Directive 54: 61
- HIV/AIDS Law: 79
- National Strategy: 61
- Decree 108: 45
- Drug Law: 41
- ”Three elves”: 28

More than 90 leadership training courses were organised in 3 provinces and the percentage of attendance to those training courses is up to 100%, 100% and 95% in An Giang, Khanh Hoa and Lang Son respectively. In addition, the attendance’s percentage is also high at all three levels approximate to 100%. The findings confirm the effectiveness and usefulness of the training courses and the late are attractive to the projects staffs.

Fig. 4: Percentage of training course attendance (n = 120)

- TOTAL: 98
- Lang Son: 95
- Khanh Hoa: 100
- An Giang: 100
- Province level: 100
- District level: 93
- Commune level: 100

The consultant team also ask the respondents of the subjects and forms of training. The most appreciated subjects are knowledge on HIV/AIDS prevention (94%), HIV law (81%), and IEC skill (80%). Moreover, most of surveyed participant comment that the content of those subjects is useful and understandable.

The two most effective forms of training are workshop (96%) and lecture (63%). It is recommended that the workshop with the opened discussion is best information mean of the projects activities and should be developed for the further similar projects. The local study tour (24%) and overseas study tour (9%) is relatively lower than the two above mentioned forms and it is explained by the limited number of people participated in those study tours.
Also, topics of training could be another concern. Some conferences on HIV/AIDS knowledge, and laws, have been lengthened more than they were supposed to because some closely related to HIV/AIDS prevention and control topics were mainstreamed into them.

We also included some closely related topic such as gender into those training sessions because this is an efficient way to do a multi-purpose training.

*Implementer - Project 42513*

The effectiveness of the training is reflected by the confidence of trainee after the training courses and the application of the knowledge gained from the training courses to the detailed projects activities.

As showed in the chart below, 100% of trainee share that they are confident, especially 78% is definitely confident and very confident to apply the knowledge to the activities after the training. The consultant team breakdown furthermore the confidence of the trainee by province and level. An equivalent percentage can be seen in the right below chart. It is assumed that the general knowledge of the trainee at provincial level is quite higher than the people at district level and commune level, so they can gain more information and it results a higher confidence level after the training courses.
77% respondent did apply frequently the knowledge gained from the training courses to activities. And two most applicable activities are to take care of PLHIV in locality (70%) and to develop the socio-economic plan of locality (46%). Besides, the other activities such as Support PLHIV initiatives, Consult PLHIV in decision making and Support breakthrough initiatives are still low. It can be explained by the percentage of 22% people did occasionally apply and 1% did never apply their knowledge to reality. However, it is recommended that the projects should review the effectiveness on the PLHIV initiatives as well as consultation to those ones.

Fig. 7: Application of knowledge gained from training courses to activities (n = 120)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did apply</th>
<th>Type of application</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NEVER</td>
<td>Take care of PLHIV in locality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FREQUENTLY</td>
<td>Socio-economic plan of locality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCCASIONALLY</td>
<td>Support PLHIV initiatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consult PLHIV in decision making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support Breakthrough initiatives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province level</th>
<th>District level</th>
<th>Commune level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lang Son</td>
<td>Lang Son</td>
<td>Lang Son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khanh Hoa</td>
<td>Khanh Hoa</td>
<td>Khanh Hoa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Giang</td>
<td>An Giang</td>
<td>An Giang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Province level</td>
<td>Province level</td>
<td>Province level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District level</td>
<td>District level</td>
<td>District level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commune level</td>
<td>Commune level</td>
<td>Commune level</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 **Collaboration Party & National Assembly**

Strengthening leadership in guiding local work on HIV is one of the main contributions of the programme. It has been recognised that both Directive 54 and HIV Law have been implemented in tight collaboration, and as result their implementation from national to lower levels has been quick and effective. The Leadership Programme simultaneous support to PCSA and CCPE has thus been appreciated.

At central level, in January 24th, 2007, the Commission for Science and Education issued Guideline No.01 – HD/BKGTW guiding the intersectional participation and cooperation in HIV/AIDS prevention and control under the spirit of the Directive 54.

The National Conference on Leadership role in HIV/AIDS prevention and control on December 2007 has been organised which was co-chaired by Deputy Prime Minister and the Vice chair woman of NA and Chairman of CCPE. The conference had called for leaders to translate commitments of the Party and the State into such concrete action as i) paying more interest in HIV/AIDS prevention and control; ii) Further strengthening the monitoring, supervision and evaluation of Directive 54 implementation; iii) Instructing the mainstreaming of HIV/AIDS indicators/activities into socio-economic development programmes; and so on.

At provincial level, the Regional conference on Leadership role in HIV/AIDS prevention and control was also organised in collaboration with the project 42513 with the participation of the Chair people or vice chair people of PPC, CPE of 54 provinces/cities.

The PMUs of 2 projects has collaborated to organise 3 training courses for nearly 200 participants from 3 provinces in order to mainstream the HIV/AIDS indicators/activities into socio-economic provincial development programmes. And 3 project provinces had organised 6 training courses for around 300 officers at provincial and district level on Guidelines on principles and process of mainstreaming HIV/AIDS prevention and control into local socio-economic development plans.

“Overall, I think the projects are going in the right direction and are able to encourage participation from all political agencies”

“My overall evaluation is that the project is most successful in incorporating both National Assembly and Party agencies and local Government. Few projects can achieve this.”

*Initiators & Implementers*

4.3 **IEC activities**

A third major objective of the projects was to establish Party’s guidelines on IEC and directions for behaviour change communication (BCC) and anti-discrimination.
On November 30th, 2005, Directive 54 – CT/TW of the Central Party Secretariat on strengthening the leadership in HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control in the new situation was promulgated.

In February 14th, 2006, a month and a half after the issuance of the Directive 54, the Central Commission for Science and Education in conjunction with the Party’s Civil Affairs Committee of Ministry of Health issued the Guideline No.15 – HD/BKGTW-BCSD guiding the implementation the Directive 54.

In December 2006, the Plan for renovation of BCC in HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control for period 2006 – 2010 (No.21 – KH/TTVH) and in April 12th 2007 the Guideline No.28 – HD/TTVH “Guideline on the implementation of renovation communication for behaviour change in HIV/AIDS prevention and control under the spirit of the Directive 54” were promulgated by CCPE. In attempt to realize the Plan and Guideline, from October, means of CCPE (CPE review, Vietnam Communist Party online newspaper and communicators’ review) have been developing specialized columns on HIV/AIDS prevention and control in order to communicate and timely reflect the contents stated in the Plan in line with Directive 54 and Law on HIV/AIDS.

At provincial level, based on the Central Guidelines, 3 project provinces had developed and issued the Plan for renovation of IEC in HIV/AIDS prevention and control for period of 2007 – 2010, including Plan No.35/KH-UBND dated July 4th, 2007 of Lang Son PPC; Plan No.36/KH-TW dated September 14th, 2007 of Khanh Hoa Provincial Standing Party Committee; and Plan No.21-KH/BTGTW dated December 25th, 2007 of An Giang CPE.

Moreover, CCPE had compiled the teaching toolkits/materials on renovation of IEC activities for behaviour change in HIV/AIDS prevention and control and conducted capacity building trainings for key officers from mass media agencies at Central levels and 3 project provinces. A circle of artists and writers, the mass media people as well as other social strata in the whole country were mobilized to be involved in initiating IEC products for behaviour change.

The stigma and discrimination is reduced so much at all level through the projects activities and I really appreciate this achievement.

*Initiator and Implementer*

A wide array of trainings and contests with a view to improving Party leaders’ knowledge and skills of implementing IEC activities have been conducted in all 3 projects provinces in parallel with the other projects activities.

It has appeared that the IEC activities were very attractive. As showed in the figure below, the projects staffs in 3 provinces were actively participated in IEC activities as initiator (22%) and implemener (34%), especially 51% of them had conducted both.
As can be seen in the chart 9, the majority of respondent (73%) answered that the IEC activities were implemented in their locality at least once a month, including 11% everyday, 14% 2-3 days a week. In other hand, it is observed that the IEC activities in An Giang were developed more than Khanh Hoa and Lang Son. However, it seems that those activities are weaker from the higher level to the lower level (59%, 34% and 24%) which showed in the right below chart.

The projects officers in 3 project provinces share that they meet lots of difficulties while conducting the IEC activities at their locality. Four biggest barriers pointed out by the surveyed informant are i) lack of resources - 77%; ii) Lack of staff – 48%; iii) Lack of specialist – 41% and iv) Lack of community interest – 29%. Those four barriers are to
confirm the finding on the decreased frequency of IEC activities from the provincial level to commune level.

Those barriers influence negatively to the effectiveness of projects activities. In provinces, the capacity building activity to the local staffs was conducted through lots of training courses but the local human resource is limited, therefore they can not best execute projects activities, especially IEC activities.

From the consultant’s point of view, the barrier of lack of community interest is very negative to the sustainability of project activities. It is recommended that this barrier should be minimized by providing more awareness raising campaigns and events oriented to the community.

**Fig. 10: IEC activities’ barriers (n = 120)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of resources</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of staff</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of specialists</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Community interest</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4 Multi-sectoral collaboration

Under the technical support from the project, PCSAs developed the monitoring and evaluation framework to support multi-sectoral collaboration on the implementation of HIV/AIDS related laws and policies.

The duties and responsibilities of ministries, branches and agencies in HIV/AIDS prevention and control have been regulated in the new HIV Law; however, the implementation of the cooperation amongst those bodies is ineffective. The MoH, the focal agency in HIV/AIDS prevention and control, cannot figure out the total external resources for HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Vietnam due to the limited coordination mechanism. At provincial level, all provinces and cities established the Steering Committee of Drug, Prostitution and HIV/AIDS prevention and control chaired by the Vice chairman of PPC but the regulation on multi-sectoral cooperation mechanism is not available, therefore, the Department of Health and the Provincial Centre of HIV/AIDS prevention and control or Preventive Health Centre are in charge on most of activities.
An Giang would be considered as a model for the project in terms on multi-sectoral collaboration. An Giang regularly mainstreams HIV/AIDS prevention and control concerns to monthly conference for communication organized by provincial CPE. Socialization of HIV/AIDS prevention and control has been more and more strengthened with more and more effective participation of PLHIV and their families. Besides, the social forces were mobilized to take care, support, and enable PLHIV and their families to be self-conscious in their involvement. And An Giang has been able to establish HIV/AIDS association.

The sustainability is not highly appreciated in the projects activities and the local stakeholder had pointed out the key factors to continue the HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities. Out of 9 given key factors, 3 most important ones are i) Multi-collaboration (97%); ii) More involvement of the Party (85%) and iii) Technical assistance (93%).

It is surely that a good multi-sectoral collaboration will facilitate the mechanism to implement all projects activities.

In addition, it is assumed that the knowledge of the people working in central party is higher than the local ones, therefore more involvement of the Party through the direction, the guidance will actively contribute to the projects.

The strengthened leadership and capacity building of the party and of the elected bodies are main objectives of the projects. And the objectives would be realised through the technical assistance activities.

**Fig. 11: Key factors for the future (n = 120)**

| 1. Multi-sectoral collaboration | 37 |
| 2. More involvement of the Party | 95 |
| 3. Technical assistance | 93 |
| 4. Expansion of the 2 projects | 92 |
| 5. More involvement of elected bodies | 91 |
| 6. Financial assistance | 89 |
| 7. Merit-based award system | 83 |
| 8. Stability of trained officers | 80 |
| 9. More involvement of Justice agencies | 79 |
4.5 Leadership and knowledge in HIV/AIDS prevention and control area

4.5.1 Knowledge of HIV/AIDS

Improved knowledge of the beneficiaries on HIV/AIDS is certainly one of the major short-term impacts of the projects.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% AGREE (Fully or Partly)</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>LANG</th>
<th>SON</th>
<th>KHANH</th>
<th>HOA</th>
<th>AN GIANG</th>
<th>Province Level</th>
<th>District Level</th>
<th>Commune Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CORRECT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>District Total</td>
<td>Commune Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infectious disease that cannot be cured</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deserves equal rights in access to health services and work</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>84</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stigma and discrimination is a crime</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protected by Vietnamese and international laws</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is remarkable to look at the high percentage for the correct contents like “Deserves equal rights in access to health services and works” (98%), “Stigma and discrimination is a crime” (95%), and “Protected by Vietnamese and international law” (98%). The correct answer at commune level is somewhat lower than provincial and district levels.

The knowledge of the participants in 3 provinces is significantly improved through the projects activities, most of them does not consider HIV as a social evil or threat to the public health even they express the responsibility to the community when they share that HIV prevention and control is not only the responsibility of MoH but also of society.

4.5.2 Agreement on Harm reduction interventions

The interventions applied to reduce the HIV harms are highly agreed by the local participants, 94% is fully agreed with the free condoms provision, 92% with safe injections and 79% with methadone. It is once again to confirm the effectiveness of the capacity building and awareness raising activities of two projects.
Fig. 12: Assessment of Harm Reduction Interventions (n = 120)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Fully Agree</th>
<th>Partly Agree</th>
<th>Don’t Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Free condoms</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe injections</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methadone</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.6 Overall evaluation

From the perspective of local participants, the programme is certainly a success story. 96% believe that those 2 projects are useful for their locality. Besides, they comment that the projects were successful thanks to the instructions from the central organisations (91%) – this assessment is to confirm the finding on the technical support of MoH and Central Party Commission for Popularization and Education presented above. In addition, the local participants agree on the effectiveness (88%), the efficiency (88%) and the sustainability (70%) of the undertaken projects activities. They also consider the role of local stakeholder as an important critical success factor by the assessment of the coordination among implementers (83%) and local adaptability (72%).

Fig. 13: Overall projects evaluation (n = 120)
5 Conclusions and Recommendations

In general, both projects have been successfully implemented and meet most of objectives mentioned in projects documents.

- **Relevance**

The objectives of the 2 projects are highly relevant with the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Vietnam till 2010 and a vision to 2020 which has been approved by Prime Minister in 17th March, 2004 including behaviour change in Information, Education and Communication (IEC) implementations; creation legal framework that conforms the international laws; decentralization of management in HIV/AIDS prevention and control, the program management, monitoring, supervision and evaluation capabilities.

The objectives of the 2 projects are relevant also with the One Plan 2, Outcome 1, named: “Social and economic development policies, plans and laws support equitable and inclusive growth and conform to the values and goals of the Millennium Declaration and other relevant international agreements and conventions

- **Effectiveness**

The activities of 2 projects were effectively implemented. The technical support provided by the projects, including the training courses, study tours, consultant provision, the establishment of MIS 54, etc had contributed to strengthen the leadership of Party and the people elected bodies and the multi-sectoral collaboration for the successful implementation of the National Strategy for HIV/AIDS prevention and control to 2010.

The framework for project implementation supported by UNDP is very structured and clear but it might be more effective if UNDP spent more resource for the implementing partner to be more familiar with this framework.

It is recommended that the UNDP or donor should work more closely with the stakeholder to build the technical assistance framework before deliver to the project areas to ensure the relevance, so that there would be consistent understanding across Project teams for more efficient implementation.

The projects activities are relevant and effective but still late implemented caused by lack of human resource at provincial level. Therefore the projects should recruit the high qualified people to work, especially in technical support and M&E activities.

Experience has shown that clear guidelines would allow most effective implementation of the project activities. It is advisable that the donor consider a comprehensive project manual which provides guidelines to plan, to implement and to report on the project activities. This manual should be published through a training workshop to all stakeholders involved. By so doing, any misunderstanding and inconsistency in project activities, criteria, standards and objectives would be avoided.

To confirm the results of the projects on the long term, activities will have to be maintained. The main focus should be on the implementation of Directive 54 and the Law of HIV/AIDS prevention and control. In addition, the stability of the trained leadership at all levels and
implementing a mechanism to mobilise the internal resources will be key conditions to sustainability.

**Sustainability**

For project 40232, the parts of the project that will remain sustainable after the project end include an improved awareness among target respondents of Directive 54 and established materials for IEC activities.

For project 42513, the parts of the project that will remain sustainable after the project end include a better knowledge of the HIV/AIDS Law and Decree 108 because the revised legal documents is consistent with the Law of HIV/AIDS.

The Resolutions on HIV/AIDS prevention and control were promulgated by provincial and district people’s Committees at the 3 project provinces. Those resolutions stipulate the targets and solutions for the implementation of HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities in accordance with the socio-economic conditions and localities. Besides, the project contributed directly to the “mainstreaming the HIV/AIDS indicators in the socio-economic development plan.

The NA delegates may not be able to exercise their trained knowledge provided by the projects for a long time due to their limited tenure or they retire or change positions. It would be an unsustainable fact.

The legal documents were established, the supervision parts are not strong enough to make sure that the laws are really effective. There are also suggestions that the Ministry of Justices should have been involved in the project for further supervision.

The achievements such Break Through Initiative Program, MIS-54, Winning works of the Contest for innovative ideas in IEC may not be able to sustain without financial support after the projects close. In addition, there has yet to be a mechanism to encourage financial support from internal sources other than foreign aid. It is suggested that a fund raising mechanism should be developed with the participation of all sides and to create a stable fund to maintain the effective activities in the future.

The UNDP should provide the technical support with some pilot implementation only to ensure the effectiveness and the sustainability of their funded projects.

**Enhancing policy and legal framework**

One of the most significant results of the projects is to build capacity to projects participants in the legal and policy framework: implementation and supervision two important documents which meet the international standards: Directive 54 and Law on HIV/AIDS prevention and control. It contributes to create a transparent legal and policy framework to carry out the HIV/AIDS prevention and control.

In terms of legal framework, project 42513 had delivered support to the amendment of Law, to the issuance of the law implementation guidance decrees. The project has also supported National Assembly to review and to amend some laws to be synchronous with the Law of HIV/AIDS prevention and control.
In terms of policy framework, by provision of the expertise, the conferences to diffuse the Directive 54 and its guidance decrees to the locality, the projects 400232 had contributed to speed up the high quality implementation progress of this Directive.

- **IEC activities**

Through the IEC activities, the stigma and discrimination was significantly decreased at all levels. But in provincial level, the projects officers meet difficulties while conducting the IEC activities at their locality, including lack of staff, lack of specialist and lack of community interest. It is recommended that those barriers should be minimized by providing more training courses, technical assistance to the local stakeholders and more awareness raising campaigns and events oriented to the community.

- **Collaboration between Party and NA**

The collaboration between Party and NA is one of the successful impacts of 2 projects. Those 2 projects had closely collaborated to deliver the training courses, to organise the workshops to guide the implementation of Directive 54 and to mainstream the HIV/AIDS prevention and control into local socio-economic development plans.

It has been recognised that both Directive 54 and HIV Law have been implemented in tight collaboration, and as result their implementation from national to lower levels has been quick and effective. The Leadership Programme simultaneous support to PCSA and CCPE has thus been appreciated.

- **Multi-sectoral collaboration**

The multi-sectoral collaboration mechanism was institutionalized to the local level. In 3 projects provinces, the mainstream of the HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities to the local socio-economic development plan was just implemented in two last project years but it had appeared with the detailed targets, objectives.

The duties and responsibilities of ministries, branches and agencies in HIV/AIDS prevention and control have been regulated in the new HIV Law; however, the implementation of the cooperation amongst those bodies is ineffective. The MoH, the focal agency in HIV/AIDS prevention and control, cannot figure out the total external resources for HIV/AIDS prevention and control in Vietnam due to the limited coordination mechanism. It is recommended that a detailed coordination mechanism should be taken into consideration.

An Giang is a good model for the project in terms on multi-sectoral collaboration by the creative and active activities. Two other provinces, as well as 5 new project provinces with high HIV/AIDS infected rate in the North should learn implementation experience from this successful model.

An experience exchange meeting should be organized with the participation of the central project management board, the donor, 3 provincial project management board and 5 new projects provinces mentioned above before implementing the projects activities in those provinces. Through this meeting, the experience and lessons learnt will be transferred to 5 new project management boards.
Besides, the central project management board should set up an information sharing mechanism to the project provinces to ensure the project activities’ compliance.

- **Leadership and knowledge on HIV**

The knowledge of the participants in 3 provinces is significantly improved through the projects activities, most of them does not consider HIV as a social evil or threat to the public health, moreover they express the responsibility to the community when they share that HIV prevention and control is not only the responsibility of MoH but also of society.

The interventions applied to reduce the HIV harms are highly agreed by the local participants. It is once again to confirm the effectiveness of the capacity building and awareness raising activities of two projects.